

UDC

INTERNATIONAL LEGAL STANDARDS OF HIGHER EDUCATION AND GOVERNING PRACTICES OF UKRAINE

Kostiantyn HROMOVENKO

PhD in Law,

Rector of the International Humanitarian University

The article is devoted to the issue of the international legal standards of higher education in governing practices of Ukraine. There is proved that the Ministry of Education and Science of Ukraine is a key central executive body responsible for the implementation of international standards of higher education and international cooperation in this field in Ukraine. There is pointed that the main form of mention in the departmental acts of the Ministry of Education and Science of aspects of international cooperation is the reference to international scientometric databases, in particular in the field of assessing the quality of the educational process, establishing professionalism of publication of dissertations.

Key words: *governing practices, higher education, international legal standards, international scientometric databases, Ministry of Education and Science.*

МІЖНАРОДНО-ПРАВОВІ СТАНДАРТИ ВИЩОЇ ОСВІТИ ТА ПРАКТИКА УПРАВЛІННЯ В УКРАЇНІ

Костянтин ГРОМОВЕНКО

кандидат юридичних наук,

ректор Міжнародного гуманітарного університету

Статтю присвячене питанню міжнародних правових стандартів вищої освіти в управлінській практиці України. Доведено, що Міністерство освіти і науки України є ключовим центральним органом виконавчої влади, відповідальним за імплементацію міжнародних стандартів вищої освіти та міжнародної співпраці України у цій сфері. Доведено, що головною формою згадування у відомчих актах Міністерства освіти і науки аспектів міжнародної співпраці є відсилання до міжнародних наукометричних баз, зокрема щодо забезпечення якості освітнього процесу, запровадження професіоналізму в наукових публікаціях.

Ключові слова: *вища освіта, міжнародні наукометричні бази, міжнародні правові стандарти, Міністерство освіти і науки України, управлінська практика.*

STANDARDE JURIDICE INTERNAȚIONALE DE ÎNVĂȚĂMÂNT SUPERIOR ȘI PRACTICĂ DE MANAGEMENT ÎN UCRAINA

Articolul este dedicat problemei dacă standardele juridice internaționale ale învățământului superior în practicile de guvernare din Ucraina. S-a dovedit că Ministerul Educației și Științei din Ucraina este un organism executiv central cheie responsabil de implementarea standardelor internaționale de învățământ superior și de cooperare internațională în acest domeniu în Ucraina. Se subliniază că principala formă de menționare în actele departamentale ale Ministerului Educației și Științei a aspectelor cooperării internaționale este referirea la bazele de date scientometrice internaționale, în special în domeniul evaluării calității procesului educațional, stabilind profesionalismul publicarea disertațiilor.

Cuvinte cheie: *practici guvernamentale, învățământ superior, standarde juridice internaționale, baze de date științometrice internaționale, Ministerul Educației și Științei.*

The analysis of international legal standards of higher education cannot be complete without determining the forms and content of their implementation in the management practice of individual states, such as Ukraine. The development of the normative base of Ukraine on higher education and the reflection of international standards and mechanisms of international cooperation in recent decades is a broad legal phenomenon, its essential component is the rule-making and regulatory activities of the Government of Ukraine - Cabinet of Ministers of Ukraine and the Ministry of Education and Science. Of Ukraine (hereinafter - the Ministry of Education and Science).

After all, the norms of the laws of Ukraine, which reflect the forms of international cooperation, are developed in a number of acts of the Government of Ukraine on higher education, at the same time their reflection is seen as rather fragmentary. In particular, it is worth mentioning the Licensing Conditions for Educational Activities, approved by the Cabinet of Ministers of December 30, 2015 № 1187. These Conditions include requirements for the head of the project team to prepare for licensing, to qualify persons for licensing, among which less

than one article in a publication included in scientometric databases, in particular Scopus or Web of Science Core Collection and proficiency in English at the B2 level according to the Common European Framework of Reference for Languages [4]. Such prescriptions are seen as a form of indirect incentives for domestic managers in the field of higher education to international cooperation, primarily in the dimension of scientific activity.

At the same time, the Terms add that the institution of higher education institutions to train foreigners in an already licensed specialty is an extension of educational activities in the field of higher education and is subject to separate licensing. In addition, the concept of educational activity for the relevant specialty submitted for licensing should take into account the total amount of education in ECTS loans [4]. It is noteworthy, however, that this approach does not fully correlate with the practice of interuniversity agreements on mutual learning, because in fact the higher education institution must first obtain a license to study, and then in practice enter into such agreements.

It is also worth paying attention to Annex 12 to the Conditions, according to which to obtain the appropriate license must be attached copies of documents confirming the legal basis for the establishment and operation in Ukraine of a foreign educational institution or its structural unit. Such documents include an international agreement, a permit from the Ministry of Education and Science and a permit from the authorized body of the educational institution to establish and operate such an institution or its structural subdivision in Ukraine, if provided by the legislation of the respective state. In other cases, the permit includes a copy of the regulations on the structural unit for work with foreigners, the functions of which include the issuance of invitations to study and ensure the stay of foreigners on legal grounds [4]. At the same time, the procedure for granting a work permit to foreign universities in Ukraine is careful. The license conditions do not stipulate that it does not meet the principles of legal certainty.

At the same time, it should be noted that the Procedure for the use of funds provided in the state budget for the implementation of national measures in the field of education, approved by the Cabinet of Ministers of 19 February 2020 № 131 did not include anything that would measure international cooperation conducting the final stage of the Taras Shevchenko International Language and Literature Competition for Pupils and Students, the Petro Jacyk International Ukrainian Language Competition [12]. The relevant situation is seen as reflecting the attitude to international standards of higher education, which is characteristic of the Doctrine and Strategy, and not of modern laws of Ukraine on education.

However, it should be added that in this area there is a separate Procedure for the use of funds provided in the state budget for Ukraine's obligations in the field of international scientific, technical and educational cooperation, approved by the Cabinet of Ministers of November 23, 2011 № 1197, as amended, introduced in accordance with the following ten resolutions of the Cabinet of Ministers. This Procedure of 2011 determines the mechanism of using the funds provided by the Ministry of Education and Science under a separate program "Fulfillment of Ukraine's obligations in the field of education and international scientific, technical and educational cooperation" [11]. It should be noted that this budget program is sustainable and therefore the rules of the relevant Procedure are important for the higher education system, in the dimension of international cooperation.

It should be added that under this Procedure, in particular, the executors of works specified in the programs of scientific and technical cooperation with international organizations and foundations, bilateral international programs are determined on the basis of protocols of joint commissions or other documents provided by international agreements. To develop a budget program, the relevant action plans and lists of international programs and projects are submitted to the Ministry of Finance within two weeks of their approval [11]. In general, the rules for the development and implementation of this budget program do not contain fundamental differences from the general organizational and financial mechanisms in this area.

Thus under Art. 3 of the Order of 2011 budget funds can be spent on: implementation of international programs and projects by higher education institutions in accordance with international agreements; examination and monitoring of the state of implementation of international scientific and technical projects; preparation and holding of meetings of control commissions on implementation of the specified programs and projects; organization and holding of international scientific forums, summits, conferences, official events on cooperation, popularization of research and development results, as well as reception of official foreign delegations on scientific cooperation; functioning of the Ukrainian Science and Technology

Center [11]. Thus, appropriate funding is possible for existing, implemented forms of international cooperation and the introduction of new forms of it is practically not aimed.

Separately, the 2011 Procedure provided for the payment of contributions to Ukraine to the European Organization for Nuclear Research; International Center for Scientific and Technical Information; Secretariat of the International European Innovative Scientific and Technical Program "EUREKA"; to the EU budget for participation in the European Atomic Energy Community Research and Training Program. Also in the Procedure of 2011 the mechanism of payment of contributions to the European register of quality assurance of higher education, to the Organization for Economic Cooperation and Development for Ukraine's participation in the international study of quality of education PISA-2021 [11] was established. It is worth noting the obvious limitation of Ukraine's participation in international structures on education, which requires membership fees, primarily through the line of treaty mechanisms operating under the auspices of UNESCO.

Also interesting in the Order of 2011 is the definition of those responsible for the use of budget funds in certain areas. In particular, Kyiv National University was named responsible for the costs of organizing and conducting summer language courses or schools in accordance with international agreements. Taras Shevchenko. Also, this university and the Scientific and Methodological Center for Higher and Professional Higher Education of the Ministry of Education and Science were entrusted with the organization and conduct of international events in the field of higher education within the Bologna Process [11]. This approach is seen as clearly discriminatory and demotivating other higher education institutions to lobby for joint language courses and summer schools with foreign partners.

In addition, under Art. 4, art. 7 of the Order of 2011, the list of international scientific and scientific-technical programs and projects, the required amount of their funding, protocols on the terms and conditions of competitions, research priorities are approved by the relevant commissions. For the organization and holding of meetings of commissions and other protocol events by competitive selection by order of the Ministry of Education and Science must be approved executor of the Ministry of Education and Science, who has "appropriate experience in organizing and conducting international events, appropriate organizational, material and personnel" [11]. It is obvious that this provision of the Procedure provided for the involvement of a specific institution of the Ministry of Education and Science, and in this way this ministry retains general de facto administrative control over international university cooperation.

It should be added that in Art. 5 of the Order of 2011 it is prohibited to direct the relevant budget funds for the purchase of goods, works and services that are not directly related to the implementation of international scientific and scientific-technical programs and projects by higher education institutions in accordance with international agreements, preparation and holding of contractual and project meetings, commissions. Also, the Procedure of 2011 prohibited the spending of appropriate funds for the payment of intermediary services, for activities financed from other budget programs, as well as for profit-making activities [11]. Such requirements, as can be seen, are also typical of grant or technical assistance agreements.

It is also worth mentioning that the Formula for the distribution of state budget expenditures on higher education between higher education institutions, approved by the Cabinet of Ministers of December 24, 2019 № 1146. Paragraph 15 of the Formula contains the formula for calculating the complex performance of higher education institutions the indicator of international recognition of MVI is included. According to paragraph 19 of the Formula, the MVI indicator is taken equal to

1.1 (ie increased by 10% relative to the total value of MVI in 1) for a higher education institution whose serial number in one of the international rankings of educational institutions does not exceed 1000 (without division into faculties, specialties etc). The formula takes into account the latest version of the ratings, which was officially published by December 1 of the previous calendar year [21]. It should be noted that this amount of incentive is not decisive for the formula; in addition, linking the distribution of expenditures to ratings means, first and foremost, preserving funding priorities for leading Ukrainian universities, which may fall into the relevant ranking positions primarily due to the material, technical and social base accumulated over decades.

International cooperation in the field of higher education can be traced in the Composition and Regulations of the Competition Commission for the Selection of Members of the National Agency for Quality Assurance in Higher Education, approved by the Cabinet of Ministers of November 22, 2017 № 926. The European Association for the Quality Assurance of Higher Education, the European Association of Universities, the European Association of Higher Education Institutions and the European Students' Union as representatives delegated from associations of the European Higher Education Area. It was specifically stated that international representatives may participate in the meetings of the Commission by electronic video communication, and in such circumstances must confirm the results of their own voting in writing [22]. It can be seen that these provisions are a development of the provisions of the Law on Higher Education, but with the specification of the subjects of delegation of representatives to the relevant commission.

At the same time, it should be added that the Guidelines on the peculiarities of the electoral system and the procedure for electing the head of a higher education institution, approved by the Cabinet of Ministers of December 5, 2014 № 726 participation of representatives of international structures, including European Higher Education Area, did not standards in higher education were not referred [1]. Other domestic bylaws regulating the establishment of collegial bodies for education, in particular higher education, also do not provide for the participation of foreign experts.

However, international standards are to some extent reflected in government acts on the certification of higher education workers. Yes, according to Art. 8, art. 9, art. 10 of the Procedure for approval of decisions on conferring academic titles, approved by the Cabinet of Ministers of August 19, 2015 № 656, the academic title of senior researcher, professor or associate professor is awarded to employees of higher education institutions certified according to the European Recommendation on Language Education (not less than B2) or qualification documents related to the use of a foreign language and documents confirming the international experience of the candidate for the title (except for persons with disabilities of group I). Also, according to the Procedure, candidates must have published scientific papers in publications included in the international scientometric databases recommended by the Ministry of Education and Science, in the amount specified by the Ministry of Education and Science [2]. These norms are aimed at stimulating the involvement of employees of higher education institutions in the processes of international educational cooperation.

Also important in this area should be considered the Procedure for obtaining the educational and creative degree of Doctor of Arts and training in assistantship, approved by the Cabinet of Ministers of October 24, 2018 № 865. In particular, this Procedure allows as an entrance exam in a foreign language to enroll in creative graduate school certificates of internationally recognized tests. Also, according to Art. 25 and 26 of the

Order of 2018, the educational and creative program of creative postgraduate studies, in particular its educational component should be measured in ECTS credits [15]. Such instructions have the obvious consequence of a certain simplification of the procedures for academic mobility of Ukrainian graduate students.

It should be added that the current program and planning mechanisms of the government practically do not reflect aspects of international cooperation in the field of higher education. A certain exception should be considered the Action Plan for 2020-2027 on the implementation of the Concept of implementation of state policy in the field of vocational (vocational) education "Modern vocational (vocational) education" for the period up to 2027, approved by the Cabinet of Ministers of April 29, 2020 . № 508-r. In particular, in Art. 7 this Plan provided for the involvement of EU project "EU4Skills: Better Skills for Modern Ukraine" and international financial institutions [5]. At the same time, this is an exception to the general trend.

Special attention should be paid to the Decree of the President of Ukraine of January 30, 2020 № 31/2020, which declared the 2020/2021 academic year the Year of Mathematical Education in Ukraine, based on the results of the international study on the quality of education PISA on mathematical competence. This decree of the Government of Ukraine is intended to create conditions for ensuring the current level of teaching mathematical disciplines, in particular with the use of effective technologies for the formation and development of mathematical competence, taking into account best domestic and international practices, study and implementation of experience of states demonstrating high mathematical competence. research on the quality of education [19].

It should be noted that these provisions of the legislation of Ukraine on higher education are disclosed in the rule-making, management and program activities of relevant authorities, primarily the Ministry of Education and Science. It should be noted that the Regulation on the Ministry of Education and Science, approved by the resolution of the Cabinet of Ministers of October 16, 2014 № 630, is typical in its structure, and in its article. 2 among the legal bases of activity of MES the international agreements of Ukraine aren't specified, and in Art. 3 none of the tasks is aimed at the implementation of international standards or the implementation of international cooperation in the field of higher education [7]. This situation, of course, does not deprive the Ministry of Education and Science of the obligation to be guided in its own activities by international treaties of Ukraine, but at the same time characterizes the attitude of the norm of the creator to international standards.

Only item 7 of the Regulation provides for the possibility of interaction of the Ministry of Education and Science, in the process of performing the assigned tasks, "by relevant bodies of foreign states and international organizations", and among more than a hundred functions of the Ministry of Education and Science item 4 of the Regulation. 60, para. 90-1 and paragraphs. 90-2 indicates the development of regulations on the implementation of the right to academic mobility, cooperation between Ukraine and the EU "in the field of education, science, innovation and technology" and Ukraine's participation in the EU Framework Program for Horizon 2020, the Euratom Research and Training Program (these norms are added to the Regulations by Government Resolution № 225 of April 5, 2017) [7]. It is noteworthy that the Regulation does not refer to any international agreement of Ukraine in the field of higher education and to any mechanism established on the basis of such agreements.

It should also be noted that according to paragraphs. 8 item 4 of the Regulation provides for the development of the MES strategy and program for the development of higher education,

their submission to the Cabinet of Ministers [7]. It should be noted that since the adoption of the Regulation, neither the strategy nor the program for the development of higher education in Ukraine has been approved.

In the following in departmental acts of the Ministry of Education and Science it is possible to observe reflection of separate specified processes. In particular, it is worth mentioning the Procedure for monitoring the quality of education, approved by the order of the Ministry of Education and Science of January 16, 2020 № 54, which introduces external monitoring at the international level, primarily through Ukraine's participation in international comparative studies. According to this Procedure, the Ministry of Education and Science has organized the participation of educational institutions in such research; at the same time, the Procedure does not provide for specific mechanisms for monitoring at the international level [16]. This makes the measures mentioned in this order, in measuring possible monitoring at the international level, to some extent declarative.

The Regulations on Accreditation of Educational Programs for Higher Education Applicants, approved by the order of the Ministry of Education and Science of July 11, 2019 № 977, should also be cited. on quality assurance in higher education in the European Higher Education Area (ESG-2015), as these are the criteria for evaluating the program. As for the content of the criteria, the Regulation requires checking the compliance of the scope of the educational program and individual educational components, defined in the ECTS credits, the presence in the programs of "clear and understandable rules" recognition of learning outcomes in other educational institutions on the recognition of qualifications in higher education in the European region in 1997 [6]. This domestic normative act can be noted as one of the few that directly refers to the relevant international agreements in the field of education.

More detailed aspects of international standards and international cooperation are reflected in the Regulations on expert groups and the Commission for state certification of higher education institutions in terms of their scientific (scientific and technical) activities, approved by the order of the Ministry of Education and Science of March 12, 2019 № 338. This act establishes for experts, evaluation indicators that include the number of articles of employees in scientific publications indexed in scientometric databases, the coefficients of influence of these journals, the number of foreign patents, the number of projects under the program "Horizon 2020", etc. [3]. In general, references to scientometric databases are considered traditional for departmental acts on higher education.

At the same time, the parameters of integration of higher education institutions into the world educational and scientific space are defined in the Methodology for evaluating scientific directions of higher education institutions during the state certification of higher education institutions in terms of their scientific (scientific and technical) activities. 2019 № 338. The methodology provides, among other things, accounting for cooperation with foreign partners, information on the promotion of results in the Ukrainian and world markets, on customers with whom "preliminary contractual relations" have been established [3]. At the same time, this administration of issues of interaction with international partners is seen as creating an additional management burden on higher education institutions.

Also, the Methodology determines as parameters the number of employees of the educational institution who are members of the editorial boards of scientific publications indexed in scientometric databases, the number of such publications founded or co-founded by the relevant educational institution, the number of publications in indexed scientific publications, and in foreign periodicals of the Organization for Economic Cooperation and Development [3]. Such a reference to

scientometric databases, typical of departmental regulation of domestic higher education, is obviously intended to promote the revival of the exchange of research achievements of educators, and hence academic exchanges and academic mobility.

It should be noted that the issues of scientometric databases Scopus and Web of Science Core Collection are also reflected in the departmental acts of the Ministry of Education and Science on the establishment of professional publications and publication of dissertation results.

In particular, the relevant instructions of the List of scientific professional publications of Ukraine, approved by the order of the Ministry of Education and Science of January 15, 2018 № 32, which in Art. 6 refers to category "A" scientific periodicals of Ukraine, included in these scientometric databases. In addition, the List requires all scientific journals to provide each published material with an International Digital Object Identifier (DOI), have a publication website with Ukrainian and English interfaces, and be included in the "profile international scientometric databases" recommended by the Ministry of Education and Science. The List also sets requirements for publications in foreign publications of scientists who will review the materials submitted for publication and will be members of the editorial board of the publication [17]. Characteristic of this dimension of departmental regulation is not only the attention to international scientometric databases, but also the careful regulation of aspects of the publication of educators' own scientific research.

Similar requirements are made by the order of the Ministry of Education and Science of September 23, 2019 № 1220, which regulates the issue of publishing the results of dissertations for the degree of doctor and candidate of sciences. In particular, this order prescribes, among other things, articles in foreign publications indexed in the Web of Science Core Collection or Scopus databases to scientific publications that reveal the main content of the doctoral dissertation. In addition, this order establishes a hierarchy of significance for the applicant of such foreign publications according to the assignment of the publication to the first, second or third quartile (Q1, Q2 or Q3) according to international classifications such as Journal Citation Reports. At the same time, for the candidate's dissertation, this order specifies other requirements, namely the presence of at least one article in periodicals of other countries, the EU or the Organization for Economic Cooperation and Development, which are equated to publications in other countries indexed in Web of Science Core Collection or Scopus [20]. This departmental act differs not only in the mention of scientometric databases, but also in the indication of differences in the classifications of publications in such databases.

It is also worth mentioning the Procedure for setting quotas for higher education by foreigners and stateless persons within the scope of the state order in accordance with international treaties of Ukraine, approved by the order of the Ministry of Education and Science on December 2, 2019 № 1498. but in Art. 1 contains a reservation that it does not apply to citizens of the aggressor state [13]. At the same time, since 2014 Ukraine has not terminated the existing agreements in the field of education with the Russian Federation (hereinafter - the Russian Federation), collective and bilateral, including interdepartmental, and currently there is no information about the relevant work of the Ministry of Education and Science in this area. This raises the issue of implementation of such agreements of the Ministry of Education and Science, provided that their formal validity is preserved.

This Procedure also introduces a category of quota for foreigners as a certain part of the amount of budget places, which is used for the reception of foreigners arriving in Ukraine for the purpose of study in accordance with international agreements. The Procedure also establishes the procedure for deter-

mining quotas of the Ministry of Education and Science and other central authorities, in the sphere of management of which higher education institutions are located. At the same time, the Ministry of Education and Science reserves the right to coordinate the work of these bodies in connection with the admission of foreigners to study. At the same time, quotas under the Order are set only for full-time education, the first degree of higher education in Ukraine, do not apply to foreigners obtaining a master's degree based on a bachelor's degree in another specialty, are not re-established after expulsion due to failure [13]. Thus, the Ministry of Education and Science has established significant restrictions on the education of foreigners in the Procedure, in particular, which are not provided for in certain relevant bilateral international agreements of Ukraine.

For Art. 9-11 of the Procedure, the Ministry of Education and Science annually monitors existing international agreements and summarizes information on the training of foreigners to plan the number of public procurement places required for their admission next year. The Ministry of Education and Science shall inform the responsible bodies of foreign states with which international agreements have been concluded and / or representations of these states accredited in Ukraine about the available quotas by December 15 each year, indicating the requirements for candidates and the list of required documents. Also, the Ministry of Education and Science annually until March 31 accepts proposals from such bodies or missions of these states on the need to train specialists in higher education [13]. It can be stated that this Procedure thus reflects similar mechanisms of bilateral international agreements of Ukraine on educational cooperation, but without taking into account the specifics of individual agreements.

In Art. 12-15 of the Procedure establishes the mode of operation of the Commission for the allocation of quotas for higher education by foreigners and stateless persons within the scope of the state order created in the Ministry of Education and Science. It is to such a Commission (and similar commissions of other authorities) that the Procedure entrusts consideration of submitted documents of candidates for study and submission of proposals on setting quotas for admission of foreigners to domestic universities, while the Ministry of Education and Science has the right in medical and art educational institutions [13]. Thus, the central authority implementing the relevant contractual provisions is the Ministry of Education and Science, although this is not provided for in the Regulations on the Ministry of Education and Science.

For Art. 17 of the Procedure, the Ministry of Education and Science sends, in accordance with the established quotas, to educational institutions, regardless of their subordination, letters with the names of foreigners recommended for enrollment, according to the relevant degrees of higher education and specialties. Thus enrollment within the established quotas is carried out annually till September 30, and in case of impossibility of arrival of entrants for the valid reasons, places of the state order, remain till the moment of their arrival, but no later than October 31 of the current academic year. If foreigners need language training, then according to Art. 20 of the Procedure, they are enrolled in the preparatory faculties or departments of higher education institutions on the basis of letters from the Ministry of Education and Science, the quota for them to obtain the appropriate degree of higher education is set for next year. In case of refusal of foreigners to study or their non-arrival to study, filling or returning unused places of the state order, in each case the educational institution can carry out, according to the Procedure, only with the consent of the Ministry of Education and Science [13]. Therefore, the above-mentioned Procedure provides for the distribution of unused places of the state order in fact in a regime not regulated by departmental acts, which is the corresponding significant risks.

These issues are also reflected in the annual acts of the Ministry of Education and Science, such as the Conditions of Admission for Higher Education in 2020, approved by the order of the Ministry of Education and Science of October 11, 2019. № 1285. in accordance with international agreements, as well as for foreign Ukrainians according to the certificate who do not live permanently in Ukraine. These Conditions also mention the possibility of recalculating ECTS credits for the admission of junior specialists and allow you to enroll as an entrance exam in a foreign language with language certificates provided not less than level B2 of the Common European Framework of Reference for Languages [18]. Interestingly, the issue of training foreign Ukrainians has not received such careful departmental regulations of the Ministry of Education and Science as the training of foreigners under bilateral agreements.

At the same time, in the departmental acts of the Ministry of Education and Science relatively little attention is paid to aspects of international cooperation in the field of electronic databases. In particular, the Procedure for ensuring access of higher education institutions and research institutions to electronic scientific databases, approved by the order of the Ministry of Education and Science of February 27, 2019 від 269 such mechanisms are not provided. This contrasts to some extent with the definition of electronic scientific databases as scientometric, bibliographic and abstract databases, which use scientometric tools to track the citation of scientific publications. The Order also referred to such databases as search engines, which "form statistics that characterize the state and dynamics of indicators of demand, activity and indices of impact of individual scientists and scientific organizations" [14].

Issues of international cooperation are not raised in the current version of the Regulation on electronic educational resources, approved by the order of the Ministry of Education and Science, Youth and Sports of Ukraine dated October 1, 2012 № 1060 [8]. Regulation on the National educational electronic platform approved by the Ministry of Education and Science May 2018 № 523 [9]. This position of the Ministry of Education and Science is seen as a significant shortcoming in ensuring the effectiveness of international cooperation in the field of higher education.

It should be added that international standards of higher education are taken into account in departmental acts of other authorities, an example of which is the Regulation on the peculiarities of the organization of educational activities in higher military educational institutions of the Ministry of Defense of Ukraine and military educational units of higher education institutions. 2020 № 4. According to this Regulation (paragraph 1.2, paragraph 1.3) educational-professional, educational-scientific, professional training program for military specialists is determined by the number of ECTS credits required to implement this program, and the curriculum for training military specialists of higher education education should include a list and volume of educational components in ECTS credits, which amount to thirty hours each. At the same time, the study time reserve should have been at least two ECTS credits per year of study [10].

Therefore, having studied the issue of reflection in the rule-making and management practice of Ukraine of international standards of higher education, it is necessary to come to the following conclusions.

Government acts are also part of the implementation of international higher education standards in Ukraine. A number of acts, such as the Licensing Conditions for Educational Activities in 2015, the Procedure for Approving Decisions on Awarding Academic Titles in 2015, the Procedure for Obtaining the Educational and Creative Degree of Doctor of Arts and Training in Assistantship in 2018 take into account aspects of international cooperation. training periods in ECNTS credits

and evaluation of publications for belonging to scientometric databases. Some elements of international legal cooperation also include the Formula for the distribution of state budget expenditures on higher education between higher education institutions in 2019 and the Regulations on the Competition Commission for the selection of members of the National Agency for Quality Assurance in Higher Education in 2017.

The only government act that systematically regulates aspects of international cooperation in education should be considered the Procedure for using funds provided in the state budget to meet Ukraine's obligations in the field of international scientific, technical and educational cooperation in 2011, which contains mechanisms for a separate permanent program of the State Budget. "Fulfillment of Ukraine's obligations in the field of education and international scientific, technical and educational cooperation."

The procedure contains conservative approaches to the development of forms of international cooperation in the field of education, reflects the limited participation of Ukraine in international structures on education that requires membership fees, concentrates opportunities for budget courses and summer schools with foreign partners only in some domestic scientific institutions.

The Ministry of Education and Science is a key central executive body responsible for the implementation of international standards of higher education and international cooperation in this field in Ukraine. At the same time, the Regulations on the Ministry of Education and Science in 2014 do not regulate the relevant powers of the ministry. Some of the prescriptions of departmental acts of the Ministry of Education and Science of international dimension are declarative in nature and do not provide for practical implementation mechanisms, and the administration of higher education institutions with international partners provides additional administrative burden on the industry.

The main form of mention in the departmental acts of the Ministry of Education and Science of aspects of international cooperation is the reference to international scientometric databases, in particular in the field of assessing the quality of the educational process, establishing professionalism of publications and publication of dissertations. The aspects of education of foreigners regulated by acts of the Ministry of Education and Science at the expense of budget funds and the state order are seen as the only sphere where international agreements of Ukraine are implemented at the departmental level. At the same time, the mechanisms introduced in departmental acts of the Ministry of Education and Science in this area do not fully meet the conditions of all current bilateral agreements of Ukraine, these mechanisms leave wide discretionary opportunities for officials of the Ministry of Education and Science.

The further development of the implementation of higher education standards in Ukraine should be the subject of new research.

References:

1. Деякі питання реалізації статті 42 Закону України «Про вищу освіту»: постанова Кабінету Міністрів України від 5 грудня 2014 р. № 726 // Офіційний вісник України. 2015. № 14. Ст. 358.
2. Деякі питання реалізації статті 54 Закону України «Про вищу освіту»: постанова Кабінету Міністрів України від 19 серпня 2015 р. № 656 // Офіційний вісник України. 2015. № 73. Ст. 2401.
3. Про державну атестацію закладів вищої освіти в частині провадження ними наукової (науково-технічної) діяльності: наказ Міністерства освіти і науки України від 12 березня 2019 р. № 338, зареєстровано в Міністерстві юстиції України

27 червня 2019 р. за № 689/33660 // Офіційний вісник України. 2019. № 54. Ст. 1895.

4. Про затвердження Ліцензійних умов провадження освітньої діяльності: постанова Кабінету Міністрів України від 30 грудня 2015 р. № 1187. Законодавство України. URL: <https://zakon.rada.gov.ua/laws/show/1187-2015-p> (Last accessed: 15.05.2020).

5. Про затвердження плану заходів на 2020-2027 роки із провадження Концепції реалізації державної політики у сфері професійної (професійно-технічної) освіти «Сучасна професійна (професійно-технічна) освіта» на період до 2027 року: розпорядження Кабінету Міністрів України від 29 квітня 2020 р. № 508-р // Урядовий кур'єр. 2020. № 98. С. 7-8.

6. Про затвердження Положення про акредитацію освітніх програм, за якими здійснюється підготовка здобувачів вищої освіти: наказ Міністерства освіти і науки України від 11 липня 2019 р. № 977, зареєстровано в Міністерстві юстиції України 08 серпня 2019 р. за № 880/33851 // Офіційний вісник України. 2019. № 65. Ст. 2245.

7. Про затвердження Положення про Міністерство освіти і науки України: постанова Кабінету Міністрів України від 16 жовтня 2014 р. № 630. Законодавство України. URL: <https://zakon.rada.gov.ua/laws/show/630-2014-p> (Last accessed: 15.05.2020).

8. Про затвердження Положення про електронні освітні ресурси: наказ Міністерства освіти і науки, молоді та спорту України від 01 жовтня 2012 р. № 1060, зареєстрований в Міністерстві юстиції України 05 жовтня 2012 р. за № 1695/22007. Законодавство України. URL: <https://zakon.rada.gov.ua/laws/show/z1695-12> (Last accessed: 15.05.2020).

9. Про затвердження Положення про Національну освітню електронну платформу: наказ Міністерства освіти і науки України від 22 травня 2018 р. № 523, зареєстрований в Міністерстві юстиції України 11 червня 2018 р. за № 702/32154. Законодавство України. URL: <https://zakon.rada.gov.ua/laws/show/z0702-18> (Last accessed: 15.05.2020).

10. Про затвердження Положення про особливості організації освітньої діяльності у вищих військових навчальних закладах Міністерства оборони України та військових навчальних підрозділах закладів вищої освіти: наказ Міністерства оборони України 09 січня 2020 р. № 4, зареєстровано в Міністерстві юстиції України 05 березня 2020 р. за № 250/34533 // Офіційний вісник України. 2020. № 22. Ст. 826.

11. Про затвердження Порядку використання коштів, передбачених у державному бюджеті для виконання зобов'язань України у сфері міжнародного науково-технічного та освітнього співробітництва: постанова Кабінету Міністрів України від 23 листопада 2011 р. № 1197. Законодавство України. URL: <https://zakon.rada.gov.ua/laws/show/1197-2011-p> (Last accessed: 15.05.2020).

12. Про затвердження Порядку використання коштів, передбачених у державному бюджеті для реалізації загальнодержавних заходів у сфері освіти: постанова Кабінету Міністрів України від 19 лютого 2020 р. № 131 // Офіційний вісник України. 2020. № 20. Ст. 762.

13. Про затвердження Порядку встановлення квот для здобуття вищої освіти іноземцями та особами без громадянства в межах обсягів державного замовлення відповідно до міжнародних договорів України: наказ Міністерства освіти і науки України 02 грудня 2019 р. № 1498, зареєстровано в Міністерстві юстиції України 10 лютого 2020 р. за № 153/34436 // Офіційний вісник України. 2020. № 15. Ст. 612.

14. Про затвердження Порядку забезпечення доступу закладів вищої освіти і наукових установ до електронних наукових баз даних: наказ Міністерства освіти і науки України від 27 лютого 2019 р. № 269, зареєстровано в Міністерстві юстиції України 06 травня 2019 р. за № 463/33434 // Офіційний вісник України. 2019. № 39. Ст. 1394.

15. Про затвердження Порядку здобуття освітньо-творчого ступеня доктора мистецтва та навчання в асистентурі-стажуванні: постанова Кабінету Міністрів України від 24 жовтня 2018 р. № 865 // Офіційний вісник України. 2018. № 86. Ст. 2839.

16. Про затвердження Порядку проведення моніторингу якості освіти: наказ Міністерства освіти і науки України від 16 січня 2020 р. № 54, зареєстровано в Міністерстві юстиції України 10 лютого 2020 р. за № 154/34437 // Офіційний вісник України. 2020. № 15. Ст. 613.

17. Про затвердження Порядку формування Переліку наукових фахових видань України: наказ Міністерства освіти і науки України від 15 січня 2018 р. № 32, зареєстровано в Міністерстві юстиції України 06 лютого 2018 р. за № 148/31600 // Офіційний вісник України. 2018. № 20. Ст. 677.

18. Про затвердження Умов прийому для здобуття вищої освіти в 2020 році: наказ Міністерства освіти і науки України від 11 жовтня 2019 р. № 1285, зареєстрований в Міністерстві юстиції України 02 грудня 2019 р. за № 1192/34163 // Офіційний вісник України. 2019. № 97. Ст. 3249.

19. Про оголошення 2020/2021 навчального року Рокком математичної освіти в Україні: Указ Президента України від 30 січня 2020 р. № 31/2020 // Офіційний вісник України. 2020. № 12. Ст. 470.

20. Про опублікування результатів дисертацій на здобуття наукових ступенів доктора і кандидата наук: наказ Міністерства освіти і науки України від 23 вересня 2019 р. № 1220, зареєстровано в Міністерстві юстиції України 08 жовтня 2019 р. за № 1086/34057 // Офіційний вісник України. 2019. № 81. Ст. 2780.

21. Про розподіл видатків державного бюджету між закладами вищої освіти на основі показників їх освітньої, наукової та міжнародної діяльності: постанова Кабінету Міністрів України від 24 грудня 2019 р. № 1146 // Офіційний вісник України. 2020. № 4. Том 2. Ст. 213.

22. Про утворення Конкурсної комісії з відбору членів Національного агентства із забезпечення якості вищої освіти: постанова Кабінету Міністрів України від 22 листопада 2017 р. № 926 // Офіційний вісник України. 2017. № 100. Ст. 3061.

INFORMATION ABOUT THE AUTHOR

Hromovenko Kostiantyn Viktorovych – PhD in Law, Rector of the International Humanitarian University

ІНФОРМАЦІЯ ПРО АВТОРА

Громовенко Костянтин Вікторович – кандидат юридичних наук, ректор Міжнародного гуманітарного університету

konstantingromovenko@gmail.com